



**Sleepy Classes IAS**  
Awakening Toppers

---

# Political Science & International Relations

UPSC CSE Mains 2022

**Paper 1**

## Section A

1. Write on the following in about 150 Words each:

### a) System Approach

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the Systems approach and its origin.
  - Body -
    - Explain about the systems approach
    - Write criticism of systems approach.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- In the post Second World War period, the scholars of comparative politics became aware of the limitations of the existing approaches and led to the rise of behavioural revolution in the social sciences. The behavioural approach claimed that social and political phenomena can be studied in an objective, quantitative manner, to predict behaviour. The sub-discipline of comparative politics was influenced by this too, and it led the scholars of comparative politics to look for a new framework of analysis. This resulted in the system's approach in comparative politics.

#### Aim of the approach

- The aim of the systems approach in comparative politics was to study dynamic and ongoing processes, and thereby to study the impact of policy decisions on such processes. The focus of study shifted from an emphasis on state to an emphasis on society. It intended to study both structures and their functioning. The approach is based on the application of the systems theory to political reality.
- David Easton held that political life in totality is about authoritative allocation of values in society. Easton organizes his theory in the following steps:
  - A political system is distinguishable from the environment in which it exists and open to influences from it. The boundary of a political system is defined by all those actions more or less directly related to the making of binding decisions for a society.
  - The political system's internal structures and processes are determined by the nature of its interaction with its surrounding environment.
  - The Inputs are converted by the processes of the system into authoritative decisions, called 'outputs' by Easton.

- The 'outputs' have consequences for both the political system and the environment in which the political system exists. For the persistence of the political system, the flow from and to the environment through the political system is crucial. Without 'inputs' the system cannot work, and without 'outputs' it is impossible to identify the work done by the system.
- He focuses on two major types of inputs:
  - Demands: Demands are made by various groups or people in society. But the resources or capacity to satisfy those demands are limited in society. So the political system is entrusted with the authority to allocate values, and demands are made upon the political system for this purpose.
  - Supports: Easton talked about support as inputs to the political system too, and believed that without support, demands cannot be satisfied. Supportive behaviour may be externally observable acts such as voting for a specific political candidate, or a state of mind or orientation, such as attachment to democracy or feeling of patriotism.
- 'Outputs', as defined by Easton, are the decisions and actions of the authorities. Easton argues that apart from influencing events in the broader society in which the political system operates, they also help in shaping each succeeding round of inputs to the system. The 'outputs' are, again, in the form of material and political outputs.
- Easton identifies a 'feedback loop' operating between the political system and its environment. According to him, information about the consequences of each round of outputs and the changing conditions that impact members, is essential. Such information enables authorities to measure support for its previous actions. This also helps them take those further actions which are necessary to keep at least a minimum level of support for the system intact. Thus, the feedback loop is basically required to maintain stability in the system.

**The Systems Analysis is criticized mainly on the following grounds:**

- Methodological weakness: Some critics say that the assumption of this theory that "reality 'really' consists of systems" is problematic and misleading, while some others suggest that the systems analysis is incapable of grasping the reality of existence of individuals and isolated events not falling into a systemic relationship.
- Not suitable for empirical research: Another criticism of the approach is that, due to the difficulty in identifying boundaries and variables in the system, it is a challenging task to formulate operational definitions and perform empirical research.
- Ideological Orientation: Easton's work has been criticised for excessive preoccupation with persistence and stability in the face of changes and conflict in actual political life.

David Easton further went on to give his 'Structural functional' approach based on criticism given to the system's approach.

## b) Cultural Relativism

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about Cultural relativism and its origin.
  - Body -
    - Explain about Cultural relativism.
    - Write criticism of Cultural relativism.
    - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- Cultural relativism is the view that ethical and social standards reflect the cultural context from which they are derived. Cultural relativists uphold that cultures differ fundamentally from one another, and so do the moral frameworks that structure relations within different societies.
- The dominance of liberalism which focuses on universalism in the value system lead to growth of cultural relativism. The best example is the doctrine of Human rights. Despite its growing prominence, the doctrine of Human rights has been subjected to debate about the universalist assumption that underpins them, creating a battle between universalism and relativism.
- Social bases of human rights vs universal-Advocates of 'cultural relativism' argue that human rights for any particular community should be based on its cultural values and practices and not on any universal principles.
- It is based on the idea that customs and rights pertaining in a particular culture can be properly just and evaluated only by considering the values associated with it. This is because different societies may evolve different cultural patterns, which may have their own merits and demerits.
- Debate of Asian values vs western values -Attempts to highlight the cultural biases that operate through the doctrine of 'universal' human rights have been particularly prominent in Asia and in the Muslim world. They emphasize the existence of Asian values and Islam which reflect the distinctive history, culture and religious background of Asia and Islamic society.
- In the early 1990s, the former PM of Singapore Lee Kuan Yew, and of Malaysia Mahathir bin Mohammed, both claimed that Asian values were significantly different from Western values. Key Asian values include social harmony, respect for authority, a belief in family and community etc. Thus, the Western Human rights may not be relevant in Asian societies. In this context, Edward said that non Western societies have their indigenous conception of Human rights which differs from the Western conception.

## Conclusion

- However, the relativist critique of Human rights has been criticized to be a result of vested interest and not based on strong logical grounds. Critics argue that the opposition to human rights under the pretext of cultural relativism comes exclusively from those who commit Human rights abuses in particular cultures. This is evident in opposition to religious groups to any attempt to amend or modify personal laws.
- The criticism of cultural relativism led to the emergence of Multiculturalism. The prominent thinkers are Will Kymilca, Bhikhu Parekh who highlight the importance of preserving and promoting cultural diversity while protecting cultural identity.
- Growing racism, ethnocentrism and jingoism have ignited a lot of debates about universalism, cultural relativism and Multiculturalism.

## c) "Revolution in Permanence"

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the Permanent Revolution
  - Body
    - Explain the Permanent Revolution of Trotsky.
    - Write about the version given by Mao.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- "Permanent Revolution" was Leon Trotsky's explanation of how a communist revolution could occur in an industrially backward Russia. According to classical Marxism, only a society of advanced capitalism with a large working class was ripe for communist revolution. However, Russia met neither prerequisite.
- Further, Karl Marx conceived of a two-stage revolution.
  - First the bourgeois revolution,
  - then in sequence the proletarian revolution establishing a dictatorship for transition to communism.
- Trotsky argued that the two-stage theory did not apply. Rather, he said, Russia was in a stage of uneven development where both bourgeois and proletarian revolutions were developing together under the impact of the advanced West.
- Trotsky predicted that once revolution broke out in Russia it would be in permanence as the result of an East-West dynamic. The bourgeois majority revolution would be overthrown by a conscious proletarian minority that would carry forward the torch of revolution.
- However, a second phase was necessary namely, the proletarian revolution in Western Europe ignited by the Russian proletariat's initiative; the West European proletariat now in power rescues the beleaguered proletarian minority in Russia; and the path is opened to the international communist revolution.
- Trotsky's theory seemed corroborated in the 1917 Russian revolution. Tsarism was overthrown by a bourgeois Provisional Government in February which the Bolsheviks then overthrew in October. However, the second phase posited by Trotsky's theory, the West European revolution, did not materialize.

### Mao's notion of permanent revolution

- Mao realised the need to continuously push the agenda of revolution to avoid the coming up of new bourgeoisie. During 1942-43, Mao consolidated his position in the CPC by eliminating all his possible potential rivals through rectification campaign.



- In the early 1950s, Mao gave his famous call of "Let Hundred Flowers Bloom" which allowed different view- points in the CPC to be expressed freely and openly. Later, he attempted collectivization of agriculture followed by a call for a Great Leap Forward to bring about quick transition to communism in China.
- Mao learnt lessons from post revolution Soviet Union and warned against the emergence of the new bourgeois class who were beneficiaries of the transitional period..
- In other words, the class struggle between the bourgeoisie and the proletariat continues throughout the stage of socialism, in the political, cultural, ideological and educational fields, though its intensity might fluctuate. This is the gist of Mao's concept of permanent revolution.

## d) Bases of Power

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the Power
  - Body
    - Explain the bases of power
    - Write about authority and Legitimacy.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- 'Power' may be regarded as one of the central concepts of political science. It is said that the concept of power holds the same status in the realm of political science as held by the concept of money in the realm of economics. Bertrand Russell has defined power as 'the production of intended effects'. In other words, power denotes the ability of a person to fulfil his desires or to achieve his objectives.
- Steven Lukes argues that there are multiple debates regarding meaning of Power. Steven Lukes in 'Power: A Radical View' distinguishes between three 'faces' or 'dimensions' of power:
  - First, it can involve the ability to influence the making of decisions;
  - Second, it may be reflected in the capacity to shape the political agenda; and
  - Third, it may take the form of controlling people's thoughts by the manipulation of their perceptions and preferences.
- Power, therefore, can be exercised by a man or a group over an 'unwilling' lot. They are, therefore, one-sided. Power, to be effective and stable, often takes the character of 'authority' which also comprehends legitimacy; that is the capacity to secure willing obedience. Use of force or coercion or sanctions may be resorted to only when legitimacy fails to work. It is authority which ensures social acceptance and effective implementation of rules, policies and decisions.
- **Political Power/ Decision Making-** Lukes' first dimension of power finds multiple variations in the form of who exerts power and controls decision making for the larger masses and society. The first expression of a theory on power came in 'Leviathan' of Thomas Hobbes as complete power to political authority. Later, through Locke's work evolved the the idea of legitimacy and power based on the consent of the governed. This idea of authority came to further developed by Weber through his ideal types of traditional, charismatic and rational-legal authorities.

- The proponents of elitist theory of power including scholars like Pareto, Mosca and Michels believe the ruling group to be composed of an elite few- the talented or those with organisational skills or professional experts. This idea of power ultimately being held by an 'inner circle' was further supported by C.W. Mills in his power elite theory.
- On the other hand, the Pluralist notion of political power argues that modern forms of government and decision making are influenced by a number of groups. Pluralists believe power to be dispersed and fragmented, with decision making through through bargaining and compromise. Robert Dahl defined this as 'polyarchy'. Scholars like Charles Lindblom, however, exemplify how even in this pluralism there are certain groups that exert more control leading this system to become 'deformed polyarchy.'
- Economic Power/ Agenda setting: Here power is looked at as an exploitative concept by Marxists. In the Marxist understanding of history, society develops through several modes of production based on exploitation of one class by the economically dominant one. N. Menon argues that in Marxist analysis capitalism differs from other non-capitalist modes of production in that exploitation can take place without the direct intervention of force, through the help of State and law which are seen as the 'hand maiden of bourgeoisie' and creating the myth of juridical equality.
- Ideological Power/ Preference shaping: This type of power may be exercised to legitimize existing structures for political stability or as a productive force that shapes its very subjects. Gramsci gave the concept of hegemony to underline the spiritual and cultural supremacy of the ruling class maintained through the structures of civil society.
- Michel Foucault radically reconceptualized the notion of power considering it not repressive, but productive- that is shaping identity and subjectivity. Further rather than flowing from a single force, Foucault looks at power as capillary –flowing throughout the system like blood in the capillaries of our body. This sort of power came to be epitomised in Foucault's concept
- Apart from these ideas of power, there are two further variations that are important in analysis of nature and meaning of power:
  - The first is structural power as developed by feminist scholars like Simone de Beauvoir, Iris Marion Young etc. Patriarchy is a key category in feminist analyses of power and refers to an overarching system of male dominance operating at every level –economic, political, and cultural. An understanding of patriarchy enables us to see that power or powerlessness cannot be explained in terms of individuals alone.
  - Secondly, Hannah Arendt's notion of power who views it as the capacity to act in concert for a public-political purpose.
- Thus, power remains one of the 'essentially contested concepts' with multiple meanings and perspectives on its nature depending the school of thought. However, despite this debate power continues to be the central concept in the study of politics.

## e) Locke's Social Contract.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the social contract tradition.
  - Body
    - Explain the Lockean version of social contract.
    - Compare with the version given by Hobbes .
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- Locke's life coincided with one of the most significant epochs of British history which saw the transformation of absolute monarchy and parliamentary democracy (Glorious revolution). As a result of which, he developed an optimistic view of human nature. He takes a balanced view of human nature.
- Owing to this optimistic conception of human nature, Locke emphasized that as man was able to lead a social life on its own in the state of nature, creation of state is not a necessity but a matter of convenience. This led Locke to envisage a social contract as a basis for state, which is necessary to remove inconveniences faced in the state of nature such as absence of common authority etc.

### 2 types of social contract

- Lockean Social contract is different from Hobbes in a sense that Locke gives two types of contracts. The first Contract forms Civil society and the second contract forms the government.
- Therefore, the problem is to form civil society by common consent of all men and transfer their right of punishing the violators of Natural Law to an independent and impartial authority. For all practical purposes, after the formation of civil society this common consent becomes the consent of the majority; all parties must submit to the determination of the majority which carries the force of the community. So all men unanimously agree to incorporate themselves in one body and conduct their affairs by the opinion of the majority.
- After they have set up a political or civil society, the next step is to appoint a government or 'legislative' to declare and execute the natural law. This Locke calls the 'supreme' authority established by the commonwealth or civil society. Here we have two separate acts-one by which the civil society is established and the other which creates the government.
- While the first is the product of a contract, the second is "only a fiduciary power to act for certain ends", and there remains "still in the people a supreme power to remove or alter the legislative, when they find the legislative act contrary to the trust reposed in them." This is also the reason why when the Lockean contract fails, there is civil society by contract that negates violence and chaos which takes society to the state of nature.



- The relationship between society and the government is expressed by the idea of trust because it obviates making the government a party to the contract and giving it an independent Status and authority. Thus, Locke differed from Hobbes in so far as he conceived of the state of nature not as a condition of complete license but rather as a state in which humans, though free, equal, and independent, are obliged under the law of nature to respect each other's rights to life, liberty, and property.
- Individuals nevertheless agree to form a commonwealth in order to institute an impartial power capable of arbitrating disputes and redressing injuries.
- Accordingly, Locke held that the obligation to obey civil government under the social contract was conditional upon the protection of the natural rights of each person, including the right to private property. Sovereigns who violated these terms could be justifiably overthrown by peaceful revolution or election. Thus, Locke's social contract theory proposed a minimal state.
- However, Bentham criticised the Social contract theory as 'a bad history, bad logic and bad philosophy'. He said that it's impossible to have such broad and inalienable rights.

## 2a) Factors like community, culture and nation weaken the hegemony of neo-liberalism today. Discuss.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about neoliberalism.
  - Body
    - Explain the Permanent Revolution of Trotsky.
    - Write about the version given by Mao.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- Liberalism, as an ideology, is centred around the 'individual' & 'individual liberty'. C.B. MacPerson characterised liberalism as 'possessive liberalism' as it regards Individual as the proprietor of his own personal capabilities & choice. Thus, the greatest virtue of liberalism is its relentless commitment to individual freedom, reasoned debate & toleration.
- The evolution of Welfare state witnessed a backlash in the 1960's and 70's especially with the emergence of Thatcher in UK and Ronald Reagan in USA. Neo-liberals sought return the principles of classical liberalism focussing on individualism. Against 'cradle to grave' welfare State. Neo liberals like Hayek, Nozick, Friedman blamed the interventionist State for creating a class of dependent, free-loaders.

### Features of neo-liberalism

- Market fundamentalism: An absolute faith in the market, reflecting the belief that the market mechanism offers solutions to all economic and social problems. In that sense, neoliberalism goes beyond classical economic theory. Free-market economists, such as Friedrich von Hayek and the US economist Milton Friedman, attacked the economic role of government.
- Hayek put forward economic and political critique of central planning in particular and economic intervention in general. He argued that planning in any form is bound to be economically inefficient because state bureaucrats, however competent they might be, are confronted by a range and complexity of information that is simply beyond their capacity to handle. (Indian bureaucracy and need for latent hiring).
- Friedman criticized Keynesianism on the grounds that 'tax and spend' policies fuel inflation by encouraging governments to increase borrowing, without, in the process, affecting the 'natural rate' of unemployment.
- On the other hand, they saw market economy to have numerous benefits like:
  - Markets tend towards long-term equilibrium and are self-regulating.
  - Second, markets are naturally efficient and productive.

- Third, markets are responsive, even democratic, mechanisms due to existence of competition
- Finally, markets deliver fairness and economic justice. The market gives all people the opportunity to rise or fall on the basis of talent and hard work

**However, it has witnessed some serious challenges from various sources.**

- **Communitarian critique**-The Challenge to neo-liberalism came from the communitarian critique that identified the difficulty in placing values and identifying in the abstract notion of individuality. Alasdair, McIntyre argued that individualism suggests that the self is unencumbered, drawing its identity entirely from within rather than its social historical or cultural context. He held that liberalism suffers from unrestrained egoism and is incapable of promoting cooperation and collective endeavour.
- **Multiculturalist critique**- A similar threat to neo-liberalism appeared with the advent of multicultural societies and multiculturalism which is based on a collective notion of identity based on ethnicity, race, culture etc.
- Also, globalisation has led to cross border migration of people and it has now led to resentment by natives fuelling right wing nationalism.
- Whilst nationalism has always been an integral part of the capitalist system , the current variety of it differs in that it is becoming inimical to the ideas of democracy and lends itself to authoritarian tendencies more easily.
- Nationalism, coupled with globalisation, has evolved into a rabid jingoism that fosters an environment of mistrust towards all things foreign. Its ramifications can be witnessed in the form of border control, supply chain disruptions, protectionist measures, and other moves that display an overt preference for the domestic over the foreign. These measures have been seen to have acquired fresh vigour since 2016 with the victory of President Donald Trump in the United States and the vote on Brexit in the United Kingdom. Also, Covid-19 pandemic further deepened the economic crisis giving fillip for the rise of right-wing parties in Sweden, France and Italy.
- In addition to these challenges and threats to liberalism, the end of the bipolar world has unleashed new and non-liberal forces such as fundamentalism in the Middle East, Islamism and Confucianism which has the capacity to offer non-western and non-liberal ideas.
- However, history has shown that liberalism has faced challenges and has evolved over time to overcome the shortcomings and to stay relevant as a dominant ideology.

## b) "Equality of estates caused equality of power, and equality of power is liberty". Comment.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - deconstruct the statement
  - Body
    - Explain Marxian notion of freedom in contrast to liberal notion of liberty
    - Link with communism of Marx where there will be perfect equality
  - Conclusion -link with Indian constitution .

### Answer

- According to Dr. Asirvatham, "The French Revolutionaries were neither mad nor stupid when they made liberty, equality and fraternity their war cry." Similarly, According to Prof. Pollard, There is only one solution of liberty, it lies in equality.
- The statement has been given by Marxists criticizing liberal idea of 'liberty'. Liberals like Locke emphasized equal opportunity to all which inadvertently favours more liberty and proposed a minimal state.
- Marxian notion of liberty-However, the Marxist concept of freedom is different from the liberal views. The liberal view is based on the centrality of the individual and his freedom of choice, but for the marxists the individual is not separated from other individuals in society by boundaries of autonomous spaces for individual exercise of choice. They are rather bound together in mutual dependence.
- The notion of individuality is likewise transformed into a notion of rich individuality, which emphasises the social embeddedness of the individual, the idea that individuals can reach a state of creative excellence and develop their capacities only in a society which seeks the development of all its members.
- For the Marxists, therefore, freedom lies in the development of creative individuality, and cannot be achieved in a capitalist society where individuals are separated by boundaries of self-interest and where they can only imagine themselves to be free when in reality they are bound by structures of exploitation. It is only in a society, which is free from the selfish promotion of private interests that a state of freedom can exist. Freedom, thus, cannot be achieved in a capitalist society.

- Communism as a state of perfect equality-Marx says that an individual cannot enjoy freedom and self-determine his actions in feudal and capitalist society, because he does not have access to resources and feels alienated. Marx says that an individual gets alienated from his society, from family, from his environment and also from the product he makes, as he does not earn enough to buy the very same product. Marx says that an individual can attain freedom only if he revolts against the capitalist system of production. To achieve further equal and free society, workers will give away their power to create a communist society where no one will rule others and distribution of resources will be according to need.
- Marx emphasise that an individual can realize himself truly only in a communist society. Neo-Marxists such as Herbert Marcuse in his work, *One Dimensional Man: Studies in the Ideology of Advanced Industrial Society* blamed the consumerist society for depriving individuals of their real freedom. He says that the mass media creates a false desire for trivial material goods, thus, diverting them from the genuine need of freedom. He says that an individual should be made aware of alienation to realize freedom.
- Similarly in Indian context the idea of Affirmative action [reservation] and Ambedkar's view of social democracy can be sited as an example of equalizing of power by enhancing the liberty of marginalized section.

## Conclusion

- However, some thinkers believe that liberty and equality are opposite to each other and Hogg, Hayek, Friedman, Acton, Tocqueville, Begehut, May etc are of this view. As per them, When we try to establish liberty, equality gets lost. We try to bring an able and disable person on the same level which results in withdrawing liberty of an able person. According to the views of Lord Acton, "The passion for equality has made vain the hope of liberty."

**c) Elitist theory of democracy denies the possibility of democracy as “rule of the people”. Elucidate.**

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the democracy
  - Body -
    - Explain about the elitist theory of democracy.
    - Write criticism of elitist theory of democracy.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

**Answer**

- Democracy has a long tradition. But the notions regarding its essence and grounds of its justification have been revised from time to time. Dicey, in his famous work *Law and Opinion in England*, treated democracy as a form of government under which majority opinion determines legislation.
- Elitist theories were originally developed in the field of sociology to explain the behaviour of men in a social setting. Their implications in the field of politics posed a challenge to democratic theory, which was in turn revised by several thinkers. Broadly speaking, the elitist theories hold that every society consists of two categories of men:
  - the elite or the minority within a social collectivity which exercises a preponderant influence within that collectivity; and
  - the masses or the major city which is governed by the elite.
- Mosca postulated that the people are necessarily divided into two groups: the rulers and the ruled. The ruling class controls most of the wealth, power and prestige in society and exercises all power, whatever form of government might be adopted. The rules are not competent to replace it.
- ***Iron law of oligarchy***-Michel propounded his famous 'iron law of oligarchy' which implied that every organization, whatever its original aims, is eventually reduced to an 'oligarchy', that is the rule of the chosen few, based on their manipulative skills.
- Majority of human beings are apathetic, indolent and slavish and they are permanently incapable of self-government. Pareto came to the conclusion that the 'elite' show highest ability in their field of activity whatever its nature might be, while masses are characterized by the lack of qualities of leadership and fear from responsibility. They feel safe in following the direction of the elite.

- **Existence of power elite**-Concept of 'power elite' was given by C. Wright Mills, which implied a combination of several groups who exercised all power by virtue of their high status in all important spheres of social life. It signified an inner circle of power holders in modern American society. According to Mills, the power elites do not owe their power to fulfilling social demands. They themselves are capable of creating such demands. They occupy the strategic command posts within the social structure.
- Power elites constitute a self-conscious class whose members help each other on the basis of mutual understanding, tolerance and cooperation in order to strengthen each other's power and position. They project their image of high moral character only with a view to commanding respect in society, but they are scarcely sensitive to their moral or social responsibility.
- On the contrary, the pluralist theory views policy-making in a democracy as a decentralized process characterized by bargaining between competing autonomous groups. Robert Dahl developed a model of democratic process as 'polyarchy'. As per Laski and MacIver there is existence of multiplicity of associations that assert their control.
- In this context, public policy is an outcome of interaction among all groups who claim or express interest in a particular issue.
- Fukuyama argues that with advent of social media there is more democratization is taking place- for example, Backlash against elites such as Arab Spring, power to people through increasing social movements across the world.

## Conclusion

- Thus, elite theory of democracy goes against the very essence of democracy by not including the masses. The ideal democracy is about giving voice to the voiceless, power to the powerless, which is far away from the elitist theory of democracy.

### 3 a) Examine the liberal theory of State in contemporary politics.

- Introduction - Briefly write about the importance of state in political theory.
  - Body -
    - Explain about the liberal theory of state.
    - Write the significance of liberal theory of state and its criticism.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

#### Answer

- The concept of the state has figured as the central theme of traditional political theory. R.G. Gettel defined political science as 'the science of the state', while J.W. Gamer claimed that 'political science begins and ends with the state'.
- Classical liberalism is characterized by a belief during a 'minimal' state, whose function is restricted to the upkeep of domestic order and private security. Modern liberalism, in contrast, accepts that the state should help people to assist themselves. The liberal-individualist approach began making a clear distinction between the state and society. The state came to be associated with public matters-mainly of governance.

#### Liberal theory of state

- The social contract theory of state is at the core of liberal theory. The troika of Thomas Hobbes, John Locke, and Jean Jacques Rousseau are the main exponents of social contract theory. Each one gives a different perspective on the reason and nature of social contract but the basic foundation is in a constitutional state born out of a contract among men. Classical liberalism developed the theory of laissez faire individualism, placing the individual at the centre of its philosophy what is most conducive to his interests.
- Negative liberalism and classical liberalism had sought to establish free market society to promote capitalism. But, the latter half of the nineteenth century produced a critique of negative liberalism. Rapid concentration of wealth in few hands, monopolistic control of trade, and emergence of big industrial houses created social, economic and political contradictions.
- A thorough revision of liberal theory required re-examination of nature and functions of the state. This opened inquiry into the relationship between individual, society and state. The product was "Positive liberalism" which was carried out by J S Mill, T H Green, Harold Laski, etc.
- The importance of State can be described in the words of T. H. Green as: "Human consciousness postulates liberty, liberty involves rights, rights demand the state."The state's function is removing obstacles in the way of men's pursuit of ideal objects which is a positive function. He favored interference by the state to secure the welfare of the citizens.

- Neo liberalism's perspective arose as a reaction to disenchantment with the welfare state. The troika of Hayek, Nozick and Friedman emphasized on new perspectives i.e. new liberalism also called Neoliberalism. They sought to revive the original tradition of laissez faire philosophy liberalism. This new form of liberalism that is libertarianism upheld full autonomy and freedom of the individual. Welfare state's inability to achieve what it had promised to deliver, income disparities and socio-economic inequalities remained the common scenario. Rolling back of state became the norm as neoliberals criticised the role of 'Nanny state'.
- Hayek criticized planning and collectivism in his work 'The Road to serfdom' where he argued that, "Planning is both practically dangerous and economically inefficient". Robert Nozick proposes a nightwatchman state with minimal role of state to protect rights of citizens.
- However, the liberal state has been under criticism by Marxists for rising inequality, regional disparities and environmental degradation. Thomas Piketty, has highlighted the rising inequality in both developing and developed world due to neo liberal policies. Occupy Wall Street, Extinction rebellion are outcomes of neoliberal policies.
- Thus, liberalism has to be more humane and try to address the gaps in the society so as to stay relevant.

**b) Human Rights are complex and contested social practice that organises relations between individuals, society and the state. Comment.**

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about human rights and its origin.
  - Body -
    - Explain about the liberal view of human rights.
    - Write criticism of human rights and complexity involved.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

**Answer**

- According to James Nickel, human rights are basic moral guarantees possessed by the virtue of being human. According to Luban, human rights are demanded of all humanity. They provide for the moral foundation of any system of rights. In 1948 the United Nations issued an elaborate list of human rights, known as 'Universal Declaration of Human Rights'.
- Human rights are therefore 'universal' rights, in the sense that they belong to all human beings rather than to members of any particular nation, race, religion, gender, social class or whatever. This universalism was clearly expressed in the words of the American Declaration of Independence.
- However, there've been deep divisions about what human rights should enjoy. As a result of significant academic debates, content of human rights has developed significantly over time, enabling three generations of human rights to be identified
  - First Generation Rights (civil and political Rights) based on liberal perspective of rights. These were the earliest form of rights which deal essentially with liberty & participation in political life. The core civil and political rights are right to life, liberty & property, freedom from discrimination etc. They're typically seen as 'negative rights' as they can be enjoyed only if constraints are placed on others.
  - Second Generation Rights (Social, economic & Cultural rights) based on socialist perspective of rights. The struggle for these rights gained prominence during the 20th century especially in the post-1945 period. By contrast with traditional 'liberal' rights, these rights drew on 'socialist' ideas towards social justice. These rights include-right to work, right to healthcare, right to education etc. These rights are 'positive' rights in that they imply a significant level of state intervention.

- Third Generation Rights (Solidarity rights/ Green Rights) based on the communitarian perspective of rights. These encompass a broad spectrum of rights, whose main characteristic is that they're attached to social groups or whole societies, as opposed to separate individuals. They're, therefore, seen as collective rights/people's rights. Such rights include-right to self-determination, right to peace, right to environmental protection & multicultural rights.
- **Critique by cultural relativism**-However liberal theory of human rights is criticised by cultural relativists. While the universal human rights doctrine aims to protect all human beings without any form of discrimination, cultural relativism emphasizes on cultural diversity as the element of importance. The individualism of human rights presents a host of complexities in non-individualistic cultural context.
- As such, cultural relativists, who support each culture's right to variation, pose a challenge to universal application of human rights. The idea of cultural diversity and relativism leads to the idea of moral relativism in the sense that what may be a violation of morality in one culture may not be considered as violation of human rights in another cultural context.
- **Idea of Asian values**-Attempts to highlight the cultural biases that operate through the doctrine of 'universal' human rights have been particularly prominent in Asia and in the Muslim world. The idea of Asian values, as promoted by Lee Kuan Yaw (Singapore) and Mahathir Mohammed (Malaysia) and formally presented in 1993 at UN conference on Human Rights at Vienna, emphasises the existence of rival 'Asian values', which reflect the distinctive history and culture of Asian societies.
- Key Asian values include social harmony, respect for authority & a belief in the family & social cohesion. As such they seek to challenge the traditional conceptions of human rights as a western conception, a type of cultural imperialism and an attempt to undermine diversity. They held that western values based on individual freedom are a threat to political stability & economic development of the region.
- R2P and its critics- The Responsibility to Protect - known as R2P - is an international norm that seeks to ensure that the international community never again fails to halt the mass atrocity crimes of genocide, war crimes, ethnic cleansing and crimes against humanity.
- The concept emerged in response to the failure of the international community to adequately respond to mass atrocities committed in Rwanda and the former Yugoslavia during the 1990s. The International Committee on Intervention and State Sovereignty developed the concept of R2P during 2001. The Responsibility to Protect was unanimously adopted in 2005 at the UN World Summit.

- However as per professor **Claudia Aradau**, predicated on the Liberal logic of international security, underpinned by the dominant trope of mitigating further state collapse – the invocation of R2P is frequently accompanied by repressive and exclusionary practices, associated with militarization, securitization and highly intrusive state-building.
- *Emergence of multiculturalism*-Alternative views of human rights are given by multicultural scholars. Multicultural perspective on human rights can be found in the works of Will Kymlicka and Bhikhu Parekh. The theme of their work is to address the alienation of minorities .
- According to Will Kymlicka, ignoring the cultural differences lead to colour blindness and liberal conception of citizenship. He suggests three sets of rights- self governance rights/autonomy rights, special cultural rights and representation rights.
- It is very relevant in contemporary situations as around the world there is an ongoing clash of civilizations and there is an assertion of minorities in countries like France . In the case of the USA, we have seen social movements like Black Rights Matters. In India also we have seen movements like Shaheen Bagh Protests.
- To conclude, the Human rights debate is complex and is going to become worse in the age of de-globalization, ultra-nationalism & racism.

### c) Individualism is inherent in Hobbes' absolutist ideology. Comment.

- **Approach:**
  - Introduction - Briefly write briefly about Hobbes.
  - Body -
    - Explain how Hobbes is an individualist.
    - Write criticism of Hobbesian view.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

#### Answer

- Hobbes is generally regarded as the father of modern political science. To quote Oakeshott, Hobbesian 'Leviathan' is the greatest sole masterpiece of political philosophy written in the English language. He laid down a systematic theory of sovereignty, law, human nature and political obligation.
- Hobbesian views about human nature and preservation of life and order constitute the foundation of his entire political philosophy. He subscribed to the pessimistic view of human nature and thus, suggested a basis for the absolute sovereignty of state.
- Hobbesian 'Leviathan' gives the first full statement of theory of absolute and unlimited sovereignty of the state. Unlike Jean Bodin, who failed to overcome the medieval mentality and limited the concept of sovereignty only to the secular sphere of life, Hobbes removed all the limitations imposed by Bodin which hedged sovereignty.
- On the basis of his anarchical doctrine of 'state of nature' which is nasty, poor, brutish and short, Hobbes provided justification for his conception of an all-powerful state. He has argued that a sovereign state cannot accomplish the task for which it was created unless it is provided with absolute and unrestrained powers. Therefore, he makes it obligatory on the part of citizens to render unconditional obedience to the state authority.
- This common superior or sovereign has to be created through a covenant with the sovereign outside this covenant. Sovereignty is indivisible, inalienable and perpetual. The Sovereign acts according to natural law but he alone is the interpreter of this law and his action cannot be challenged. It is in this context of absolutism, Hobbes is regarded as the first modern political philosopher.

- However, According to Sabine, the absolute power of the sovereign, a theory which Hobbes name is associated with, was really the necessary complement of his individualism. This is because the state is not an end in itself, rather a means to the end of individual security and welfare. According to Hobbes, man has transformed all of his natural rights but has retained the natural right to life or self-preservation. Hobbes argues that the obligation to obey the sovereign remains only so long as the sovereign has the power to protect its subjects and it disappears when the state power loses the capacity to defend them.
- As Prof. Sabine has rightly pointed out, in Hobbesian political philosophy both individualism and absolutism go hand in hand. Granting absolute and unlimited power to the state is, in essence, an attempt to provide a happy and tension free life to the individuals.
- In the same line, Nisbet argues that despite the rigorousness of his theory, it is the individual whom Hobbes has in his mind as the embodiment of virtue. Hobbes did not seek the extermination of individual rights but their fulfillment. Nisbet held that in Hobbes, the greatest claim of the absolute state lay in its power to create an environment for the individuals to pursue his natural ends. It is for this reason, Hobbes is considered to be the greatest of all individualists.

4a) Dr. Ambedkar's idea of social justice leads to 'egalitarian justice' as compared to Rawls' 'justice as fairness' which aims at the notion of 'pure procedural justice'. Comment.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the concept of justice.
  - Body -
    - Explain Ambedkar's idea of justice.
    - Explain about the Rawls's theory of justice.
    - And give comparative sense of both
  - Conclusion -link with Amartya Sen's capability approach

### Answer

- Justice is one of the most crucial concepts of political theory. Importantly, it's a multi-dimensional concept. Justice, is about giving each person what he or she is 'due' - 'desert'. It has been differently conceived at different times depending on the views and ideology prevalent. • Justice is often seen as linked to law.
- The Romans integrated the ideas of 'natural justice' with the positive law of the state. John Austin tells that the law has to function as an instrument of justice, on the one hand, and function as an instrument to suppress mischief, on the other.
- However, justice also deals with broader society and public policy- principles of allocation of goods, positions, rewards and services- social justice. Various political systems have formulated principles of justice as their foundation.
- In 'Social Justice', David Miller accepted that the concept is essentially contested and socially relative, but tried to identify a number of contrasting principles of justice. These are
  - to each according to his needs',
  - to each according to his rights' and
  - 'to each according to his deserts'.

### Ambedker's idea of social-justice

- Valerian Rodrigues identifies Ambedkar as a political philosopher in his essay "Ambedkar as a Political Philosopher", and lists out the concerns of justice, liberty, equality, community, democracy, authority, legitimacy and recognition as his lifelong pursuits.

- His idea of social justice is inclusive of political and economic justice too. Ambedkar sought prioritization of the social upliftment of the least advantaged, including Dalits, minorities, women and workers.
- He believed that the caste system, communalism, patriarchy and industrial exploitation of workers created inequality and stood in the way of a just society. Due to the rigidity and persistence of these sources of inequality, Ambedkar prescribed an active role of the state in the emancipation of the unequals. The cornerstone of Ambedkarite justice is liberty, equality and fraternity.
- Ambedkar in his work annihilation of caste vehemently opposed the caste system as it clearly violates the principles of liberty, equality and fraternity. It takes away an individual's right to choose an occupation for himself. Hence, Ambedkar suggested reservation as a measure for social emancipation
- Ambedkar was deeply concerned about the rights of minorities.. He was aware of the threat facing the minorities within a majority-dominated area, and thus supported the demands made by minorities for proper representation in the legislature, executive and the public services.
- Ambedkar never forgot to mention the denial of rights to women within the Hindu social system. He condemned sati, child marriage and argued for widow remarriage in accordance with his vision of restructuring the Hindu family system. Ambedkar thus felt strongly about the discrimination against women in a patriarchal society and called for gender justice.
- The laws, to Ambedkar, were to be such that it guaranteed the rights of the least advantaged. The Hindu Code Bill, which Ambedkar introduced in Parliament, ran counter to the brahmanical law, the code of conduct within the Hindu family.
- Ambedkar's vision of egalitarian justice allowed for unequal treatment to benefit the least advantaged in society - which resembles John Rawls' theory of "justice as fairness". He recognized rights and laws as key to justice, rights determine the concept of justice and law of the land protects the rights. On the other hand, the caste system, communalism, patriarchy and exploitation of workers were, to him, major impediments for the establishment of a just society.
- Ambedkar insisted that social restructuring of society precede an economic and political revamp because he believed that social justice would eventually lead to political and economic justice. Our society has yet to embrace his vision of justice as it refuses to let go of the caste and gender hierarchies.
- **Rawls idea of justice**-Rawls' concept of justice seeks equal consideration of all people.". Rawls' idea of "justice as fairness" is both political and moral in conception, formulated keeping in mind the basic structure of modern constitutional democracy.
- Rawls' propounded the liberal egalitarian theory of social justice and presented a very strong idea of justice based on the tenets of procedural theory. Inspired by Kant's moral idea of freedom and equality, Rawls gave centrality to the moral principle of freedom and equality of every person (liberal egalitarian principle).

- Rawls refers to his conception of justice as pure procedural rather than perfect procedural and imperfect procedural. Within the pure procedural theory, Rawls accepts there are no perfect, universal principles, but only the existence of perfect or 'fair/just' procedure.
- For Rawls justice is about rules/procedure that govern a social practice, not the outcome. Regardless of the outcomes yielded, if the procedure is followed correctly, the outcomes are morally acceptable.
- Rawls, in order to arrive at principles of justice, places man behind 'veil of ignorance' in a hypothetical 'original position', where individuals are deprived of basic knowledge about their social context, abilities, skills, etc
- According to Rawls, the purpose of principles of social justice is to ensure that the distribution of benefits and burdens of society is just and fair to all. He argues that the distribution of social primary goods such as liberties, powers, opportunities, rights etc is just and fair, if that distribution is made in accordance with the following principles
  - Each person to have an equal right to the most extensive liberty compatible with similar liberty to others
  - Social and economic inequalities are to be arranged so that they are both
    - to the greatest benefit of the least advantaged, and
    - attached to offices and positions open to all under conditions of fair equality of opportunity .
- Both Ambedkar's theory of justice and Rawls' theory of justice resembles in a sense that both seeks to establish a just and fair society considering the inequality within society and value human dignity and empower weakest links of the society.
- At the end it can be concluded that Rawls' procedural and Ambedkar's substantive theory of justice is reflected in Amartya Sen's theory of justice as a capability.

b) "The Panchayat with Gram Sabha should be so organised as to identify the resources locally available for the development in agriculture and industrial sectors". Examine the statement in the context of Gram Sabha.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the importance of villages
  - Body -
    - Explain about the Gandhian idea of Gram swaraj
    - Write about Panchayat Raj and Gram sabha.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- In the modern Indian political discourse, the sharp contrast between the urbanised high tech cities and the poverty stricken villages of India has been a constant reminder that exploitative nature of neoliberalism has kept multitudes of Indian people living in the Indian villages in total servitude and destitution.
- Gandhi provided a philosophy of a village centred life which he described as the gram swaraj philosophy. Since the overwhelming majority of Indians live in villages, Gandhi's primary concern is to concentrate on this important segment and provide a blueprint by which the face of rural India would drastically change for the better.
- Gandhi is a virulent critic of all models of western industrialisation as though they produce material goods but are alien to our moral values. The village panchayat system and the village republic could create both a participatory model of democracy and would also allow an escape route to avoid the perils of western industrialisation.
- Gram Swaraj will be the essential framework of this alternative model with the promotion of self-sufficiency in providing the material conditions essential for fulfilling the needs of the individual and enhancing the elements of self-respect and pride in oneself.
- He observes that "there can be no industrialisation without predation" and that agriculture was and is the greatest among all the occupations. Gandhi is against use of chemical fertilizers and desires the use of organic manure as a way of 'Economy of Permanence' as against the man-made 'Economy of Transience'.
- Gandhi clarifies that swaraj is self-rule and self-restraint grounded in the moral autonomy of the individual. He sees an intimate link between swaraj and swadeshi or self-reliance.
- This perspective broadens the whole concept of economic life and includes:
  - The primary importance of man in production, distribution and exchange.

- "Machinery for man and not man for machinery has to be the cardinal principle of mechanised production".
  - From the preceding point of view, industrialisation involving mass production, centralisation of initiative, power, authority and policy formulation is undesirable and is to be reduced to the barest minimum.
  - A logical consequence of this is that decentralisation of production is to be carried to the maximum possible extent.
  - "Small communities of producers means economic and social democracy, reduction of inequalities within a very limited range and decentralized initiative".
- Gandhi supports those machines that are necessary to satisfy the basic human needs. He also feels that industries should be socially owned by which he means welfare of society. He wants limited industrialisation to satisfy limited wants such as food production, shelter, health care and basic education.
  - Countries like India with abundant labour, unemployment and underemployment ought to restrict the use of machinery. On both these scores, Gandhi's blueprint is of immense importance to us. The prosperity of the village is the key to create a new balanced India, for checking the uncontrollable migration to cities that are bursting in its seams and not in a position to offer the means for decent and dignified life and also ensuring a balance between agriculture and industry.
  - Based on these Gandhian ideals, the Indian constitution provides a clear mandate for democratic decentralization, not only through the DPSPs, which exhorts the state to promote Panchayati Raj Institutions, but specially through 73rd and 74th Amendments of the constitution to create an institutional framework for ushering in grassroots democracy by giving them powers to make local development plan in both the rural and urban areas of the country.
  - Therefore, in order to achieve constitutional aims, such as ensuring justice in socio-economic and political domain and ensuring 'life of dignity' etc, there must be promotion of decentralization in substantial sense rather than mere institutionalization (as done by 73rd and 74th constitutional Amendment Acts).

### c) Examine the entitlement theory of justice.

- Approach:
  - Introduction - Briefly write about the libertarian perspective of justice.
  - Body -
    - Explain about the Nozick's entitlement theory
    - Write criticism of Libertarian view.
  - Conclusion - Give a balanced conclusion.

### Answer

- Libertarian perspective on justice also treats liberty of the individual as its central problem. But it focuses on formal liberty and insists on a minimal role of the state in the economic activities of individuals. This perspective is chiefly represented by Nozick's theory of justice.
- Robert Nozick sought to advance an alternative to Rawls's theory of justice. Whereas Rawls sought to moderate his libertarianism by a modicum of egalitarianism and communitarianism, Nozick adhered to libertarianism in its pure form. If Rawls is known as a 'left liberal' or egalitarian liberal advocating a substantially redistributive welfare state, Nozick may be described as a 'right liberal' or libertarian committed to a laissez-faire 'nightwatchman' state.
- Nozick ridicules Rawls's approach which seeks to determine the principles of distribution of certain goods as if they have come to us as a gift from heaven. Nozick insists on a realistic approach which should account for the different modes of acquisition of goods and entitlement of different individuals to own those goods.
- He has identified three sources through which various goods are acquired by individuals:
  - Their selves – their bodies, brain cells, etc. They have absolute rights over them.
  - The natural world – land, water resources, minerals, etc. Individuals may acquire bits of the natural world through several methods and may become entitled to their use as they like. This is precisely the area where principles of entitlement are required to be determined according to logic; and
  - The things people make by applying themselves to the natural world – agricultural and industrial products, etc. An individual's entitlement to these products may not be questioned. Voluntary transfer of these goods will establish others' entitlement to them.

People's entitlement to self-ownership of their body and mind and their physical and mental faculties are obvious which need no further justification. Their entitlement to bits of the natural world and the products of their labour should be based on the principles of justice. Nozick identifies three principles on which this entitlement would conform to justice:



- Initial acquisition: the method whereby an individual comes to appropriate some previously unowned bits of the natural world. Those who come to settle in an uninhabited continent may legitimately acquire its land and natural resources on first come first served basis, as long as nobody is made worse off by their doing so. This means that this mode of acquisition should not result in creating scarcity for others.
- Voluntary transfer: it applies to all property whether acquired through initial acquisition or by mixing one's labour with the natural world, i.e. by means of one's talents, efforts, enterprise, etc. in a market situation.
- Rectification: this is precisely the area where the state or the international community will be justified to intervene in order to restore justice. Nozick concedes that the history of the world abounds with involuntary transfers as well as unjust acquisitions of natural resources. As long as economic disparities result from voluntary transfers, Nozick is not bothered. But if some country has gained control over rare natural resources depriving others of their legitimate share, Nozick would step in to register his protest.

Nozick claims to discover the principles of justice for all human beings, but his bias is quite clear. He is an out-and-out champion of a competitive market society which favours the rich and the resourceful, and lets the weak go to the wall. He absolves the rich of all social responsibility, not to speak of social indebtedness.

In a very large part of the contemporary world, justice is thought to be the 'voice of the oppressed'. But Nozick wants to maintain the prevailing oppression in the name of justice! Even his principle of 'rectification' is designed to legitimize the huge riches of the manipulators, and hit at the only assets of oil-producing countries because oil is needed world over and its resources are confined to a small region.

Nozick invokes moral principles to demolish a redistributive, welfare state. He approves of taxation only for the provision of the common services, like streets and street lights, police and defence, etc. When a part of taxes imposed on the rich is spent on welfare of the poor, Nozick would term it immoral, as it is akin to 'forced labour'. In Nozick's view it involves using abilities and efforts of one section as means to others' ends; it involves involuntary transfer and, therefore, violates the moral principle.

- He is not prepared to concede that the operation of competitive market society may itself create certain conditions of injustice. In contrast, Rawls's provision for the regulation of social-economic inequalities on the condition of giving greatest benefit to the least advantaged shows his genuine

concern for justice.

- **Very elite and so is not practical as he says is**
- Vargas observed that the most significant shortcoming of the entitlement theory is that it is a construction without any foundation ....as it is, it has very little, if any practical value.

- Philosophers like Chia are critical on Nozick's assumption that just situations result from just actions. He considers a case where an individual willingly sells himself or herself into slavery. Here, no justice in transfer was violated but in effect the free individual (an end) is subsumed as a means, and self-ownership violated.
- Another criticism leveled against justice in transfer was that it was not systematically delineated by Nozick. The accumulation of wealth is said to lead to acquisition of power that might express or manifest liberty. This implies that it is not socialism that actually restricts liberty, rather it is capitalism. Goldsmith states that critics add that capitalism would lead to exploitation of labour making acquisition of wealth even more unjust. For instance in the society, the rich normally have more to say than the poor.
- Rectification as per Narveson is a tall order, and not easily accomplished in a wide variety of case.

In his later work, *The Examined Life*, Nozick reflects that entitlement theory's defense of people's holdings may have some problems, in that it could eventually lead to the vast majority of resources being pooled in the hands of the extremely skilled, or, through gifts and inheritance, in the hands of the extremely skilled's friends and children.

## Section B

### 5. Answer the following in about 150 words each

#### a) Analyse the workers' movement in India in the Pre-Independence period.

- Introduce with origin/beginning of workers movement
- Elaborate workers movement in detail
- Mention shortcomings of movement
- Conclude appropriately

#### Introduction

- The modern working class arose in India in the nineteenth century due to the establishment of modern factories, railways, dockyards etc
- The working class movement is a much broader phenomenon and covers all kinds of movements involving workers.
- Initial Attempts to Improve Workers' Conditions were made in 1870-1880 to better the working conditions of the workers by legislation.

#### Workers Movement In Pre Independent India

- **First Phase : 1850-1918**
  - In 1880, **N.M Lokhande** started his weekly **Deenbandhu** to demand shorter working hours for workers.
    - Consequently in 1884, the Bombay cotton mill workers held a big meeting and submitted their demands to the government for lesser hours of work.
  - Similar activities were started by the Brahma social reformer **Sasipada Banerji** and **Dwarkanath Ganguli** among the Bengal jute mill-workers and tea plantation workers
    - Sasipada Banerjee founded the '**Working Men's Club**' in 1870 for the betterment of the working class.
  - The strikes however were only sporadic, spontaneous, localised and short lived.
- **Second Phase : 1918-1947**
  - The trade unions emerged in India after the First World War which raised the consciousness of workers.
  - During the 1920s, the Congress and the communists mobilised the working class and from then onwards the national movement established a connection with the working class.

- The **Madras Labour Union**, formed in April 1918, was the first trade union in India. Similarly the **Textile Labour Association** was established in Ahmedabad in 1920.
- The workers movement reached the pinnacle with the formation of **All-India Trade Union Congress** under the leadership of **Bal Gangadhar Tilak and Lala Lajpat Rai**.
  - Lajpat Rai was the first to link capitalism with imperialism. He held that “imperialism and militarism are the twin children of capitalism”.
- From here onwards, the worker movement became much more organised and even had an ideological tone to it because the Gandhian philosophy of non-violence, trusteeship and class-collaboration had a great influence on AITUC.
- The dip in working class movements was seen from 1931-1936 when split occurred due to divergence between the nationalist and communist opinions.
  - The communists had called for the dissociation from the ILO and association with the League against Imperialism.
- However later when World War II broke out the workers were first to launch an anti war strike in spite of the severe repression by the government to prevent any disruptions during the war.
- Despite the best efforts, the worker movement suffered from problems like
  - fragmentation of unions
  - affiliation of the unions with political parties
  - adoption of militancy leading to repression by state authorities
  - a general apathy towards organising workers employed in the unorganised sector of the economy and
  - overlooking the problems of women workers

## Conclusion

- Nonetheless, the workers movement can be credited for raising the worker consciousness throughout the country and improving the working conditions of those previously neglected under the oppressive capitalist system.

## b) The preamble of the Indian Constitution reflects itself as a 'social contract'. Elucidate.

- Define what is meant by social contract
- Explain how preamble reflects the core features of a social contract
- Conclude suitably

### Introduction

- Social Contract is an actual or hypothetical agreement among the members of an organised society or between a community and its ruler that defines and limits the rights and duties of each
- The theoretical foundations of social contract were laid down by English philosophers like Thomas Hobbes and John Locke in the 17th century.

### Preamble As Social Contract

- In 1947, India became a free nation. In 1950, it became bound again. India didn't lose its freedom and go back to bondage as slaves. Instead, the people collectively agreed to be bound by a contract (Constitution) among themselves.
  - Preamble is a foreword to this social contract and the constituent assembly members held that the constitution should be read and interpreted in the light of grand and noble vision expressed in Preamble.
- Consequently the Preamble which begins with "WE, THE PEOPLE OF INDIA, having solemnly resolved to constitute India into a **SOVEREIGN...**".
  - shows the people of India coming together to form a sovereign authority i.e., the Sovereign of India. This can aptly be related to the *Pactum Unionis* as described in Locke's theory.

### Democratic

- This is based on the legal status of "Damas Cratus" which means rule of people i.e. where the Government gets its authority from the will of the people. The rulers are elected by the people and are responsible to them.
- Locke also talked about the theory of **Limited Government** which means under the Social Contract the people did not surrender all their rights to the sovereign authority. The individual retained with them certain rights such as right to life, liberty and estate

### Republic"

- The Constitution of India is republican in nature as the executive head of India is not any hereditary monarch. This indicates the form of Government in which the Head of State will be an elected person but not a monarch.

- In Locke's **Letter Concerning Toleration**, Locke argued that the government and members of religious society have no right to coerce members of other groups.
  - This is also reflected in the preamble of the Constitution of India wherein under Articles 25 and 26 religious freedom is granted to every citizen. Thus, the Preamble rightfully holds India as a secular state.

and to secure to all its citizens." – *justice, social economic and political..*"

- This is a declaratory statement wherein the ultimate objective of the Constitution lies.
  - **Economic justice** can be and ought to be ensured by rational policy making and it's proper implementation. Socio-economic justice has been ensured by provision such as Art. 38 and 39.
  - **Political justice** is ensured by way of the right of adult franchise i.e. exercise of right to vote as soon as a citizen attains the age of 18 years.
  - **Social justice** actually requires the abolition of all sorts of inequities which result from inequalities of wealth, opportunity, race, caste as well as religion. **Art. 14 to Art.18 provides for equality of status and opportunity.**
  - **Moreover, word socialist in Indian constitution 's preamble also reflects the objective of ensuring social-economic justice.**

**liberty, of thought, expression, belief, faith and worship.."**

- The Constitution regards liberty of thought, expression, belief, faith and worship to be essential to the development of the individual and the nation, and therefore the Preamble itself promises to ensure the same to it's citizens.
- In simple words, there are no unreasonable restrictions on the citizens in what they think, how they think, how they wish to express their thoughts and the way they wish to follow up their thoughts in action. {Art. 19(1), Art. 25, Art.26 makes provision of such liberty} fraternity, assuring the dignity of the individual and the unity and integrity of the Nation.."
- Likewise the Preamble ends with "... DO HEREBY ADOPT, ENACT AND GIVE TO OURSELVES THIS CONSTITUTION."
  - reflects the attempt made by the people of India to unite together and pledge to obey an authority i.e., the constitution of India thereby forming the Government of India
  - Thus the constitution and thereby the Preamble successfully the **general will** of the Indian people.

## Conclusion

- Political power derived from Social Contract is about power originating from the people and not from above, whether from divine law or the grace of God. Thus, Social Contract Theory is a forerunner of democratic theory i.e. the government of the people, by the people and for the people.
- And the modern democratic Preamble that we see in India has its basis in the social contract theory.

Sleepy Classes IAS

### c) Legislative council is a house without any effective powers. Comment.

- Begin by stating that India has a bicameral system
- Briefly tell the significance of Upper House
- Elaborate clearly all the major powers of State Legislative Council (SLC)
- Explain other side as well i.e why SLC is considered useless
- Conclude with suggestions on how to reform SLCs

#### Introduction

- India has a bicameral system i.e. two Houses of Parliament namely Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha.
- At the state level, the equivalent of the Lok Sabha is the Vidhan Sabha or Legislative Assembly.
  - Additionally the states can have a Legislative Council also under **Article 169** of the Constitution.

#### Need of Legislative Council

- For ensuring checks and balances at state level and preventing hasty legislation at state level.
- Councils act as a forum for calm and informed deliberation because it is the House of elders and has members from academia and industry.
- It ensures that individuals who might not be cut out for the rough-and-tumble of direct elections too are able to contribute to the legislative process.
- It lessens the burden of the lower House and enables it to fully concentrate on measures of greater importance.

#### Powers Of Legislative Council

- **Legislative Powers**
  - Non-money bills can be introduced in the Legislative Council.
    - When a non-money bill, passed by the Legislative Assembly, comes to the Legislative Council, the latter can pass it, or can send it back with amendments to the legislative Assembly for its reconsideration
- **Financial Powers (LIMITED)**
  - A Money Bill cannot be introduced in the Legislative Council.
    - When a Money Bill comes from the Legislative Assembly to the Legislative Council, the latter is required to take action on it within 14 days.
    - If the Council passes it, then the bill is sent to the Governor for his assent.

- **Constituent Power (LIMITED)**
  - When a constitution amendment bill comes to a bicameral state legislature, the bill has to be passed by both Houses of the state legislature.
    - However in case of difference of opinion between the two Houses, the voice of the Legislative Assembly shall prevail.
- **Control Over Executive**
  - The members of the Legislative Council may enforce accountability on the government by asking questions and moving different motions in the Council, but they cannot force the Council of Ministers to resign.

### Legislative Councils Have No Effective Powers

- Unlike the Legislative Assembly which has substantial powers to shape non-financial legislation, Legislative Councils lack the constitutional mandate to do so.
- Legislative Assemblies also have the power to override suggestions/amendments made to legislation by the Council.
- While Legislative Assembly members can vote in the election of the President, members of Legislative Councils can't.
  - MLCs also can't vote in the elections of Rajya Sabha members.
- As regards Money bills, only **fourteen days'** delay can be caused by the Council, which is more or less a formality rather than a barrier in the way of Money Bill passed by the Assembly.

### Conclusion

- Second chambers were supposed to serve as a "check upon democratic outbursts" of the lower house and provide an element of sobriety and second thought.
- However in practice they have proved to be of only ornamental value and are popularly acknowledged as Rolls Royce institutions in the bullock-cart country.'
- According to a parliamentary committee set up to review the working of legislative councils, there is a need for a **National Policy on having Upper House in State Legislatures** to rework their functioning for healthier functioning of parliamentary democracy

d) How far is the National Commission for Backward Classes an empowered body? Assess its role in the context of rising demand for backwardness among dominant communities.

- Begin by stating the formation of NCBC
- Briefly talk about the recent rise in demand for backward status by communities
- Discuss how NCBC is empowered to handle these demands
- Mention challenges faced by NCBC in addressing these demands
- Conclude by giving suggestions on how NCBC can be made more efficient and productive.

### Introduction

- Previously a statutory body under the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment, NCBC attained the status of a constitutional body after the passage of **102nd Amendment Act, 2018**

### Rising Demands And Is NCBC Empowered?

- In recent times demand for other backward caste (OBC) status by various communities such as Patidars, Kapus, Jats, and Marathas have increased.
  - These communities have been unable to compete for jobs in urban landscapes. Combined with dwindling no of agrarian jobs in rural areas has led to demand for reservations.
- NCBC shall examine requests for inclusion of any class of citizens as a backward class in the lists
- It is empowered to hear complaints of over-inclusion or under-inclusion of any backward class in such lists and tender such advice to the central government as it deems appropriate.
  - State governments are exposed to muscular pressures of communities which are not socially backward to force their way into the backward list. The centre is less vulnerable to pressure.
  - NCBC will deny opportunity to the political parties to have free ride on aspirational demands for political gains.
- **Article 338B** provides authority to NCBC to suggest welfare measures regarding socially and educationally backward classes.
- NCBC also has all the powers of a civil court which makes it an institution with teeth to bite.
- Senior advocate and human rights lawyer **Indira Jaising** →
  - making it a constitutional amendment means that it cannot be amended by a simple majority in Parliament.
  - Secondly, it will be a permanent commission in place, similar to the NCSC and NCST

- However, NCBC itself faces several challenges
  - The recommendations of the NCBC are not binding on the government.
  - It lacks the power to define backwardness so it cannot address the current challenge of demands of various castes to be included as BCs.
  - There is underrepresentation of members from backward communities in the commission

## Conclusion

- The government must put information in public domain regarding the findings of the caste census and recommendations of commission.
- Certain core recommendations must be made binding subject to approval by parliamentary board/committee
- Lastly, vote bank politics should give way to value based politics so that only truly backward sections can be targeted through welfare policies.

## e) High concentration of economic activities and consumption patterns in post-liberalisation period has led to the failure of environmental movement in India. Elucidate.

- Lay down the context that fast unplanned economic development is threatening the environment and communities dependent on it
- Explain with stats and figures how India is threatened due to unsustainable development
- Link how this unsustainable model is linked to environmental movements post 1991
- Mention India's steps and commitments towards environment
- Conclude on lines of sustainable development

### Introduction

- **RC Guha and Madhav Gadgil** in their book **"This Fissured land: An ecological history of India"** have stated that nature based conflicts revolving around competing claims over forests, land, fisheries have increased in frequency and intensity, thereby adding a new dimension of Indian democracy and civil society.
- It also poses an ideological challenge to the dominant notions of the meaning, content and patterns of development.

### Economic Development Causing Degradation

- According to the **Global Climate Risk Index** → India was the **7th most vulnerable country** in 2021 with
  - 62% cropped area prone to droughts
  - 5700 km coastline prone to tsunamis and cyclones
  - **21% forest cover** prone to fires as per a report by FSI
- India generates **3.5 million tonnes** of plastic waste annually, of which 40% uncollected and 43% single use.
- India 3rd largest producer of e-waste
- Rampant Deforestation for developmental activities have led to → soil erosion → landslides, forest fires etc
  - **NITI Report,2018** → ~60% water sources in Indian Himalayan Region is on verge of drying up and 30% springs have already dried up
- This unplanned development and rising consumerism has led to increase in environmental movements

## Post 1991 Movements

- According to **Ramachandra Guha** environmental movements in post liberalisation era can be studied as the 3rd and 4th phase of Indian environmental movements which is marked by
  - The growth of professionalism. Social scientists and natural scientists started producing credible data, looking for the roots of environmental conflicts.
  - However in the 1990's onwards there was a backlash against environmentalism.
- Government adopted neo-liberal model based on private capital. Consequently environmental protests against mining, SEZ were seen as anti-developmental, anti-national
  - Since, the tribal protests increased, even left wing movements gained strength, environmentalists and human right activists were treated as anti-national

## India's Commitment Towards Environment

- India has given the slogan of **One LIFE, One World**, at Glasgow.
- India recently announced new climate targets at COP26 under its '**Panchamrit strategy**'.
  - India will increase its non-fossil energy capacity to 500GW (India had earlier extended its target to 450GW out of which 100GW is already installed) by 2030.
  - India will meet 50% of its energy requirements from renewable energy by 2030.
  - India will reduce the total projected carbon emissions by one billion tonnes from now onwards till 2030.
- **Government measures include**
  - NAPCC along with National Clean Air Programme (20-30% reduction in PM10 and PM2.5 by 2024 with 2017 as baseline)
- India has also **ratified UNCCD** and is part of **Bonn challenge** and commits to **restore 8million Ha by 2030**.
- It is expanding the Integrated Watershed Development Program, Per Drop More Crop, National Afforestation Program and National Green Mission as part of its commitment towards environment

## Conclusion

- Environment is not about saving tigers and planting trees. Government needs to look at its current development strategy which is neither pro-environment nor pro-poor.
- Environment is about democracy. Without giving powers to the people, decentralisation planning and Grassroot democracy we won't be able to achieve sustainable development.

## 6 a) Electoral behaviour of voters is governed more by the social and economic factors than the political factors. Explain.

### Introduction

- Electoral behaviour studies have been the major area of research and study among the behavioural political scientists.
- One of the earliest works in the electoral behaviour in India is by **David Butler**, in his study titled '**India Decides**: where he has shown that voters in India have voted quite sensibly.
- However, according to **Milan Vaishnav**, it is an extremely difficult task to study voting behaviour of Indian voters because of the size and diversity.

### Role Of Social Factors

- According to **LOKNITI** (CSDS- Centre for the Study of Developing Societies), we can see that Caste and religion remain the major long term determinants.
- Consequently, **Jaffrelot** calls 'caste' as the mosaic of Indian politics.
- While nominating party candidates, they take into account the 'caste arithmetic' i.e., the numerical presence of a specific caste group in a particular constituency.
- Similarly **Suhash Palshikar** argues that caste continues to be the prime building block of political affiliation at the micro-level and that voters in India consider it advantageous in their interest if the candidate is from their own caste.
- **Increasing complexity of social preferences**: apart from caste social identities like, religion, language continue to impact the voting preference of electors in India. Another major factor is also the rise of sub-nationalism based on ethnic and linguistic lines witnessed in North East India especially.

### Role Of Economic Factors

- **Kautilya** held that Politics and economics cannot be separated. As per Arthashastra. Most important goal is "artha" and the achievement of all other goals is dependent on it.
- **Pratap Mehta**, argues that
- Voters are choosing empowerment over patronage, the future over the past, performance over rhetoric, sincerity over cynicism, measured realism over flights of fantasy.
- They are carefully assessing alternatives through the prism of local circumstances. Identities still matter, but voters are no longer prisoners of those identities.
- More recently in 2014, surveyors found that economic growth, corruption, and inflation were the most salient issues among voters during the 2014 general elections.
- In 2019 elections, JAM, DBT model and successful delivery of public services without corruption influenced turned tables in favour of Modi → **Shekhar Gupta**

- **Carolyn Elliot** also discusses how the state of Andhra Pradesh is moving from **clientelistic politics** to more of a **welfare state model**

## Role of Political Factors

- However, according to some scholars like **James Manor**, the role of caste, as a factor influencing voting behaviour, has been overstated.
  - Other factors such as religion, leadership of the party, government performance etc. also influence electoral behaviour.
  - People within the same caste can have different interests depending on their economic conditions.
  - **Political factors** also influence the choice to some extent as
    - People who identify themselves with a particular party will always vote for that party.
    - Political events preceding an election like war, murder, of a leader, corruption scandal etc
- **Increased enthusiasm regarding national elections:** Vaishav argues that 2014 exhibits a clear break in voter turnout, when India recorded its highest turnout, at 66.4 percent. This degree of voter mobilization was undoubtedly a reflection of two factors:
  - widespread frustration with the incumbent Congress-led United Progressive Alliance (UPA) regime and,
  - the excitement around the candidacy of Narendra Modi.
    - In 2019, voter turnout would notch yet another record: according to data provided by the Election Commission of India (ECI), 67.2 percent of eligible voters cast their ballots. The gap between national turnout and state turnout is also narrowing

## Conclusion

- The credit for success for India's democracy goes to the great common sense shown by ordinary voters in India.
- **Prof M.P Singh** suggests that we cannot say that the verdict of any election was ever wrong. People have always voted for the best possible option.

## b) The Doctrine of basic Structure of the Constitution has enhanced the power of judicial review of the supreme Court. Examine.

- Define what it means by Judicial Review and Basic Structure Doctrine
- Explain how doctrine has enhanced Judicial Review
- Mention why doctrine is not always desirable and that there are flaws associated with its overuse
- Conclude

### Introduction

- Judicial Review is the power of the courts of a country to examine the actions of the legislative, executive, and administrative arms of the government and to determine whether such actions are consistent with the constitution.
- In the Constitution of India, **Article 13** deals with Judicial review.
- Basic Structure doctrine can be understood as a doctrine that the constitution of a sovereign state has certain characteristics that cannot be erased by its legislature.
- As per this, the Parliament can amend anything short of the basic structure but it cannot go to the extent of rewriting the constitution

### Doctrine Has Enhanced Judicial Review

- It represents extreme judicial creativity as judges have gone for understanding soul in invisible parts instead of looking at written provisions.
  - **Zia Modi** in her book "**The ten judgements that changed India**" has argued that doctrine has proved to be a blessing in disguise as it helped to restrain authoritarianism of the government. Had the judiciary not invented the doctrine, India would have gone in the same path as other 3rd world countries.
  - **Upendra Baxi** praised Indian judiciary for chemotherapy of the carcinogenic Indian politics. It has strengthened the rule of law and gave voice to the disadvantaged. It has expanded the envelope of social justice by adjudicating on diverse social matters
  - **Justice Nambyar** who was a member of the Bench that delivered Golaknath → If the Parliament's amendment's power were considered infinite, parliamentary executive can be removed, fundamental rights can be abrogated, and, in effect, what is a sovereign democratic republic can be converted into a totalitarian regime.
  - **Justice PN Bhagwati** also feels that judiciary should be an active participant in India's socio-political revolution and if they don't take active participation it means that judges want to live in the comfort zone unaffected by public criticism. And not playing their constitutional duty.

- Under the **24th Amendment**, Parliament added article 31(c) which stated that Socialistic principles 39(b) and 39(c) cannot be void on violation of articles 14, 19 and 31 and no such amendment can be questioned in court
  - However in **Kesavananda Bharati Case, 1973** SC upheld 24th CAA but struck down 2nd clause of 31C as it was violating the principle of judicial review which is an essential part of basic structure of constitution
- Later on, government through **42nd Amendment** added **368(4) and 368(5)** to nullify the doctrine of basic structure by making clear that no amendment shall be called in question on any ground whatsoever, in any court
  - However in **Minerva Mills case**, SC struck down 368 (4) and 368(5) and declared it to be invalid & unconstitutional
- However, the doctrine has been criticised on following grounds
  - **Pratap Bhanu Mehta** argues that it leads to post democracy where power with non-elected institutions is increasing that ultimately undermines the sovereignty of Parliament.
  - Gives preference to metaphysical elements rather than written provisions
  - Through this doctrine judges have projected themselves as Philosopher kings
  - No exhaustive list which lends immense discretionary power - like a hanging sword on legislature
  - It was adopted by a narrow majority - 7:6 - doesn't inspire much confidence

## Conclusion

- What was implicit in the Indian Constitution, the SC has only given it an explicit form
- And not only is the basic structure doctrine legally legitimate, in that it is deeply rooted in the Constitution's text and history, but it also possesses substantial moral value, in that it strengthens democracy.

c) Discuss the composition and functions of the Inter - state Council. To what extent has this body been successful in achieving its objective?

- Start by introducing Inter State Council
- Elaborate on its composition and functions
- Present a brief analysis of its functioning by giving its achievements and shortcomings
- Suggest measures to reform the body
- Conclude

### Introduction

- Inter-State Council (ISC) is a constitutional body as provided by **Article 263** of the Constitution.
- It aims to create a strong institutional framework to promote and support cooperative federalism in the country.

### Composition

- Prime Minister as the Chairman along with
- Chief Ministers of all States
- Chief Ministers of Union Territories having a Legislative Assembly and Administrators of UTs not having a Legislative Assembly
- Six Ministers of Cabinet rank in the Union Council of Ministers to be nominated by the Prime Minister.

### Functions

- To investigate and discuss subjects in which the states or the centre have a common interest.
- To make recommendations upon any such subject for the better coordination of policy and action on it, and
- To deliberate upon such other matters of general interest to the states as may be referred to it by the chairman.
- To facilitate consideration of all pending and emerging issues of Centre-state and inter-state relations by the zonal councils and inter-state council.

### Evaluation Of ISC Working

- During the 2016 meeting, several key topics like direct benefit transfers using Aadhaar, education and internal security were discussed at length.
- It also discussed the Punchhi Commission report (which interestingly introduced the term cooperative federalism) on centre-state relations.

- Being the only multilateral centre-state forum that operates directly within the framework of the Constitution (Article 263 (b) and (c)) topics like the GST and contemporary issues like disaster management, terrorism and internal security can be taken up in future meetings.

### Why ISC Has Not Been Successful Fully?

- **Meetings not held regularly:** ISC is required to meet at least twice in a year. In practice no meetings were held for almost 12 years between 2005-2016
- **Non-binding Recommendations** which reduce its effectiveness and role
- **Limited engagement** with External experts in the field of Law, Economics, Political Science etc.
- **No Adjudicating role** as recommended by the Supreme Court.
- **No proper coordination** with NITI Aayog and Zonal Councils

### Way Forward

- As mandated the body should meet at least thrice in a year;
- Agenda should be evolved through proper consultation with states.
- The Inter State Council Secretariat should include officials from both Centre and States.
- View of the Inter State Council to be considered before introducing a bill on Concurrent List.
- With respect to working Mechanism:
  - Decisions should be taken by Consensus
  - Empowered committee of Ministers should study and report their findings within a prescribed time frame

### Conclusion

- The ISC should be further strengthened to become the critical forum for not merely administrative but also political and legislative give and take between the centre and states.
- It should function in such a manner that it reflects the equal status of states and the centre

7a) Examine the unique features of the 73<sup>rd</sup> Constitutional Amendment. Do you think this Amendment would contribute in achieving the goal of empowerment of marginalised sections of the society?

- Introduction with 73rd Amendment act
- Mention its unique features
- Explain how it has empowered the marginalised sections
- Mention existing issues with PRI that hamper its effective working
- Suggest reform steps
- Conclude appropriately

### Introduction

- As per **George Mathew**, *Local self-governments have opened the flood gates of democracy that nobody can close it.* The 73rd Constitutional Amendment Act, 1992 enjoin upon the. states to establish a three-tier system of Panchayats at the village, intermediate and. district levels.
- States are expected to devolve adequate powers, responsibilities and finances upon these.
- The act inserted **Part IX** consisting of **Article 243 to 243-O**, and the **Eleventh Schedule** enumerating 29 functional items.

### Unique Features of 73rd Amendment

- **Gram Sabha** → is the foundation of the Panchayati Raj. It is a body that consists of persons registered on the electoral rolls relating to the village. It performs the functions at its village level as is provided by the law or State Legislature.
- **Three-tier system** → **Article 243B** provides for a three-tier system in the Panchayati Raj Institution where panchayats shall be constituted at the village, intermediate, and district levels in every state.
- **State Election Commission** → is constituted in every state for the superintendence, maintenance, control, and preparation of electoral rolls and handles the elections of panchayats
- **Manner of election** → The election of members of panchayats at all levels shall be done through direct election by the people. The elections of chairman of the intermediate and district level panchayat will be elected indirectly by the elected members of the panchayats.
- **Reservation of seats** → Reservation of seats for SCs and STs according to the proportion of their population. One-third of the total seats are reserved for women.
- **Finance Commission** → is constituted by the Governor under Article 243I to review the financial position of the Panchayats, to recommend the principles for the distribution of taxes between the state and panchayats.

- **Audit of accounts** → The State Legislature is empowered to make provisions for the panchayats to maintain and audit the accounts of panchayats.

## Empowerment Of Marginalised

- Empowerment can be defined as the expansion of people's capabilities and choices.
- In a democratic political structure, empowerment entails proper and effective representation in the institutions of governance so that people can voice their concerns and participate in the decision making process
- **Social inclusion**
  - The elected representatives of SC/ST are actively participating in the decision-making and implementation of different pro-poor programmes at the local level
- **Women Empowerment**
  - Study conducted by UNDP shows that
    - Not only have women been empowered, Panchayats have also been empowered by women.
    - Panchayats headed by women performed much better in comparison to those headed by men. C
    - Women have taken the issues of basic services like drinking water more seriously and efficiently.
    - UNDP awarded **FATIMA BEE**, a women chairperson in Kurnool district, Andhra for remarkable work in creating Women-SHG, thus providing employment to extremely poor women
  - A 2004 study by Esther Duflo and Raghavendra Chattopadhyay in West Bengal and Rajasthan found that villages with women panchayat presidents had significantly more investments in drinking water facilities. A report by Planning Commission also points to socio-economic improvement of marginalized through enhanced participation in decision making at the local level.
- **Child Education**
  - Panchayats in Wayanad district worked towards universal enrolment of children in school and increasing the quality of education
- However the goal of people's empowerment has not been fully realised due to several issues

## Persisting Issues With PRI

- **Activity Mapping** → flesh and blood left to states. 73rd act created only institutional structures (skeleton)

- **Gram Sabha powers not defined unlike PESA**
- **SEC**
  - Understaffed
  - no regular election
  - no opportunity to be heard before dissolution unlike ULBs
- **Lax Functioning of Panchayats as**
  - Panchayats have MP/MLAs as members → politicisation
  - No separate cadres so relying on state bureaucracy
  - Lack technical expertise
- **Women representatives not in proportion to population giving rise to Pati Panchayats**
- **Financing**
  - SFC lacks autonomy
  - Reports not tabled in State Legislative Assembly
  - Gram Sabha lacks power to levy and collect taxes
- **Parallel Governance Bodies**
  - Traditional bodies like **Gavki** are functioning parallel to the village panchayats. In Maharashtra, gavki is dominated by the upper castes and elite landlords.
  - **Khap panchayat** in North India are another example

### How To Further Empower PRIs?

- **Kerala model**
  - all functions transferred in one go
  - Model code of conduct for bureaucracy towards Panchayats
- **Punchhi**
  - create State Legislative Councils in all states to give representation to local bodies. It will create pressure on state govt to devolve power
  - watchdog body like **National Commission for Panchayats**
  - Mandatory Social Audit to ensure transparency. Training of PRI members
- **Augment Finances**



- **Vijay Kelkar** → **consolidated fund for municipalities and panchayats** to ensure that revenue allocated by central and state FCs flow directly to it.
- **Swaminathan A. Aiyar** recommended that central FCs propose substantial rewards for states that are serious about decentralisation, and penalties for those that are not.

## Conclusion

- If we would see our dream of Panchayat Raj, i.e., true democracy realised, we would regard the humblest and lowest Indian as being equally the ruler of India with the tallest in the land. – **Mahatma Gandhi.**

Sleepy Classes IAS

## b) The Speaker represents the freedom and dignity of the House. Examine.

- Introduce the post of speaker in Indian polity
- Explain how speaker is symbol of freedom and dignity
- Briefly mention some issues that hamper the free and impartial functioning of speaker
- Suggest reform steps
- Conclude

### Introduction

- Since the Indian System of Government follows the **Westminster Model**, the Parliamentary proceedings of the country are headed by a presiding officer, who is called the Speaker.

### Speaker Represents Freedom and Dignity

- Speaker has **FREEDOM** to decide upon the following matters
  - He/she is the final interpreter of the provisions of the Constitution of India, the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of Lok Sabha, and the parliamentary precedents, within the House.
  - Whether a bill is a money bill or not is the prerogative of the Speaker. E.g. Aadhar Act being passed as a money bill.
  - Issue of defection of MPs in Lok Sabha is decided by the Speaker
  - Accepting motions including No Confidence Motion, Impeachment motions, and privilege motions are at the discretion of the Speaker
  - The Speaker's work and conduct cannot be discussed and criticised in the Lok Sabha except on a substantive motion.
  - He/she is given a very high position in the order of precedence (placed at seventh rank, along with the Chief Justice of India).
  - In the Lok Sabha chamber, the Speaker's chair is distinctively placed to enable a commanding view of the entire House.

### Recent Issues With Post

- When it comes to deciding Anti Defection, the presiding officer might make a decision on party lines since it is not mandatory for her to resign from political party on being selected for the position of presiding officer.
  - Infact, two speakers of Lok Sabha - **Rabi Ray** and **Shivraj Patil** have themselves expressed doubts on their suitability to adjudicate upon the cases related to defection

- 2016 → 16 MLAs in the Arunachal Pradesh Assembly were disqualified by the Speaker despite not officially leaving the party or defying its directives.
- 2016 → 9 MLAs were disqualified from Uttarakhand assembly despite not leaving the party or voting against it.
- **Challenge of coalitions**
  - With an increase in multitudes of parties at union level, time available to each party in discussions has reduced. This problem is exacerbated by a decrease in the number of annual meetings of parliament.
- **Disruptionary politics**
  - Unruly behaviour of legislators inside the house prevents the speaker from performing her most important function i.e. orderly functioning of house.

## Solutions

- **Page committee** headed by V.S. Page suggested that if the speaker had conducted herself in an impartial and efficient manner, she should be allowed to continue in the next parliament.
- SC in 2020 **Keisham Meghachandra Singh vs. the Hon'ble Speaker Manipur Legislative Assembly & Ors.** case
  - told parliament to rethink speakers' role in defection decisions. Parliament may consider amending constitution to replace the role of speaker in defection cases with a permanent tribunal headed by SC judge or retired CJ of HC
- **Best Practices from World**
  - The Irish parliamentary system assigns the position of speaker to someone who has built up a reputation in the public sphere by relinquishing her political ambitions.
  - In Britain, the speaker is strictly a non-party man and a healthy convention has been developed of the speaker resigning from his party. This can be done in India.

## Conclusion

- The Speaker represents the House. He/she represents the dignity of the House, the freedom of the House and because the House represents the nation.
- Thus, in a particular way, the Speaker becomes a symbol of the nation's freedom and liberty.
- Therefore, it is right that it should be an honoured position, a free position and should always be occupied by men of outstanding ability and impartiality.

## c) Discuss the policy initiatives of the fourteen Finance commission aimed towards promoting and strengthening agriculture development in India.

- Introduce Finance Commission
- Underline how 14th FC recommendations have a bearing on agricultural development in country
- Apart from 14th FC efforts, suggest what more needs to be done

### Introduction

- The Fourteenth Finance Commission was constituted by the President under **Article 280** of the Constitution in 2013 to make recommendations for the period 2015-20.
- The main goal of Finance Commission is to correct the financial imbalances (both horizontal and vertical) in Centre State relations

### 14th FC and Agriculture

- Agriculture plays a vital role in India's economy. 54.6% of the population is engaged in agriculture and allied activities (census 2011) and it contributes 17.4% to the country's Gross Value Added.
- The commission recommends increasing the tax devolution of the divisible pool to states to 42% for years 2015 to 2020. This is 10% more compared to the 32% target set by the 13th financial commission.
- Since Agriculture is a state subject, this has direct bearing on improving the state of agriculture across the country
  - With extra funds states have been able to implement schemes across sectors like irrigation, farm mechanisation, fisheries and animal husbandry
  - Several states like Odisha, Telangana (**Ryuthu Bandhu**) and Madhya Pradesh initiated direct benefit transfer schemes for small and marginal farmers.
- Efforts of state governments were supplemented by central government through several schemes and policies
  - **Pradhan Mantri Krishi Sinchayee Yojana** → to provide relief to the farmers due to poor monsoon. Emphasis was on "water to each and every farm" along with enhancement of water conservation skill.
  - **Paramparagat Krishi Vikas Yoaja**: To promote bio-farming in the country
  - **Soil Health Card scheme** → to monitor nutrient health of farm soil due to prolonged cultivation.
  - **e-NAM** as all India electronic trading portal which aims at to form a unified national market for agricultural products

- Central government raised Budget target of **farm/agriculture credit** for the year **2020-21 to Rs. 15 lakh crores** as compared to Rs. 12 lakh crores in 2019-20.

## What Needs To Be Done More?

- *Focus more in Agri Research*
  - Budget allocation for agri research and education has constantly declined from 0.31% of GVA of agriculture and allied activities in 2011-12 to 0.24% in 2021-22
- **Reduce Post-harvest losses**
  - estimates by ICAR were at ~ **Rs 92,651 crores i.e. ~10% of agri gdp.**
- **Dalwai Committee** on doubling farmer income
  - Reduce Input Cost
  - Improve resource use efficiency
  - Higher Price realisation to turn agriculture from rural livelihood sector to a modern business enterprise

## Conclusion

- Adequate attention is required to improve the agricultural incomes and thus the welfare of the farmers to secure the future of agriculture in the country.
- Reaching this end will reduce persistent disparity between farm and non-farm income, alleviate agrarian distress, encourage inclusive growth and infuse dynamism in the farming sector.
- Decent incomes in the farm sector will also attract youth towards the farming profession relieving the non-farm job sector of the continuing burden.

## 8 a) Ethnicity is the underlying cause which poses a great challenge in the resolution of the problems in the North - East region of India. Comment.

- Define ethnicity and what it means by ethnic conflicts
- Give reasons behind ethnic tensions in North East
- Clearly explain the major issues persisting in north eastern states
- Give solutions to ongoing ethnic problems
- Conclude suitably

### Introduction

- Ethnicity is a term which categorises people based on common descent, language, history, culture, race or religion ← **Donald Horowitz**
- **Ethnic conflicts** → Involving assertion of numerically smaller and less dominant tribal groups against the political and cultural hold of the dominant tribal group. (there is a difference bw ethnic conflicts and ethnic movements).

There are mainly two perspectives which analyse the issue of ethnicity and nation building in the context of North-East India.

- First is the **modernisation/development or "nation-state building" perspective**.
  - Problems are seen as the outcome of conflict between the modern emerging middle class and the traditional leadership and the inability of the system to fulfil the aspirations of the new generation.
  - Several scholars like **S K Chaubey, B G Varghese, Myron Wiener** have presented this perspective.
- Second perspective is basically a critique of the first one and is available largely in the writings of the scholars who hail from the NE region.
  - The prominent representatives of this perspective are **Sani Baruah, Sajal Nag and M P Bezbaruah**.
  - Issue →
    - leadership has followed the notion of nationhood as per the considerations of the dominant groups and ignored the minorities.
    - Main leadership acted as a "**stepmother**"; less funds and paid less attention to Human Rights violations.
- Suggestion of **Sanjib Baruah**

- The mainstream leadership of the country should **replace their “nation-state building” approach in favour of “genuine federation-building** in order to resolve the situation.

## Ethnicity Causing Problems In North East

- With their distinct histories, geographical location and diverse ethnic composition, almost all the states of NE have been beset with the problems of ethnicity.
- **Assam**
  - agitations against 'influx of foreigners' (**rohingyas**), perceived inability of the Government to deport them.
  - 'original' inhabitants claiming that for reasons of 'vote bank politics' effective steps are not being taken to deport the 'trespassers' while people sharing the religious-linguistic profile of the 'foreigners' claim that they are harassed and unreasonably forced to “prove” their Indian citizenship (NRC, CAA)
- **Manipur**
  - One fourth of Manipur (which is the valley), is home to more than 70% of its population which is predominantly **Meitis**
  - The Meitei influence declined in the socio-economic spheres after Independence with the **tribals (Naga, Kuki-chin and Mizo groups)** coming into the forefront largely because of reservations.
  - This led to **violence between Nagas and Kukis** that took a toll of more than 2000 lives during the 1990s.
- **Meghalaya**
  - State is fortunately free from violence except some violence against 'outsiders' particularly the Bengali speaking linguistic minority.
- **Tripura and Mizoram (Brus/Reangs)**
  - In 1997, following ethnic clashes, Brus fled from Mizoram and took shelter in relief camps in Tripura.
  - After 4 corner agreement, they are being repatriated to Tripura (voting rights)
- **Sikkim**
  - Development through decentralised planning and striking a balance between various ethnic groups (mainly the lepchas, bhotiyas and Nepalis) has prevented emergence of major conflicts.

## How To Solve Issue?

- Security forces/ 'police action' but it is not long lasting
- More autonomy through Statehood, the Sixth Schedule, 'tribe specific accords', **ILP regime, NRIC for NE** and their timely implementation
- Incentivise states/ tribe councils for promoting regional peace and harmony
- Development activities including special economic packages so that enough economic opportunities are available and no tribe feels left out → **2nd ARC**
- **North East Council Act, 1971** may be suitably amended to restore the original 'conflict resolution provision' → **2nd ARC**

## Conclusion

- The fruit of development along with winning the trust and building the confidence of people of the North-East is key to bring peace, prosperity in the region

b) The making of the Indian Constitution is described as an attempt towards 'social revolution'. Comment.

- Introduce with the grand vision of constituent assembly members
- Describe how constitution is a social document and not merely a legal one
- Conclude

### Introduction

- The makers of our Constitution were well aware of the glaring social inequalities that existed in Indian society. They understood the need to provide a form of justice which could fulfil the expectations of the freedom movement.
- Thus **Granville Austin** rightly says that the Indian Constitution is first and foremost, a social document.
- The commitments to social change are contained in Part III - as Fundamental Rights and in Part IV - as Directive Principles of State Policy or what he calls "**the conscience of the constitution.**"

### Constitution Making and Social Revolution

- As **Jawaharlal Nehru** put it before the Constituent Assembly,
  - "First work of this assembly is to make India independent by a new constitution through which starving people will get complete meals and clothes, and each Indian will get the best option that he can progress himself."
- The result of this exercise is reflected in its totality in the Preamble to the Constitution. It sought to attain
  - **Justice** (social, economic and political);
  - **Equality** (of status and of opportunity); and
  - Fraternity (assuring the **Dignity** of the individual and the unity and integrity of the Nation)
- In **Part III**, the Constitution, in no unmistakable terms, declares the great rights and freedom, which the constitution of India intended to secure to all citizens
  - Traffic in human beings and forced labour have been declared unlawful and thus punishable.
  - The system of reservation has been an instance of justice given to the marginalised or underprivileged sections of Indian society.
- Similarly **Part IV** of the Constitution furthers the guarantee of 'Justice- Social, Economic and Political', by providing judicially non-enforceable obligations on 'the State' in the form of Directive Principles of State Policy.

- **Article 38** seeks to promote the welfare of the people by minimising inequalities in income, status, facilities and opportunities
- **Article 39** seeks to secure equitable distribution of material resources of the community for the common good and prevention of concentration of wealth and means of production
- Similarly there are provisions for legal aid for the poor, decent standard of living for workers and maternity benefits for women.
- Many times the constitutional provisions are also being supplemented and complemented by the Acts passed by the Parliament and the State Legislatures and judicial interpretations on them.
  - Right to Education, Maternity Benefit Act and Schemes like Ayushman Bharat are in line with India's active and ongoing social revolution
- Lastly the role of judiciary has been remarkable in the direction of social change and justice dispensing.
  - Supreme Court in **Minerva Mills v. Union of India** held that
    - "The core of the commitment to the social revolution lies in parts III and IV.
    - The Court added that Rights in Part III are not an end in themselves but are 'the means to an end', and the end is specified in Part IV.
  - In **Unnikrishnan v. State of A.P.**, the Supreme Court observed that
    - a 'man without education was no better than an animal', and held that the right to education was an essential ingredient for a dignified and meaningful life.

## Conclusion

- Thus the constitution envisions social justice, equality and dignity of person as the cornerstones of social democracy.
- As part of social revolution the constitution seeks to mitigate the sufferings of the poor, weak, Dalits, Tribals and deprived sections of the society and to elevate them to the level of equality to live a life with dignity of person.

c) How far is it correct that the regional parties have strengthened Indian democracy and federal system? Substantiate your answer with suitable examples.

- Define what is a party system
- Explain the rise of regional parties
- Discuss their impact on democracy and federal relations
- Conclude

### Introduction

- Party system is not based on the number of parties but it is based on the number of parties having systemic relevance.
- For example at the time of independence there were multiple parties but the Indian party system as described by **Morris Jones** used to be known as a one-party dominant system.

**MP SINGH** has identified two kinds of regional parties in India.

- **First**, the longstanding regional parties owe their origin to deep cultural divisions in India society. E. g Tamil parties (around WWI), Akali Dal(1920s) and National conference (Muslim Conference,1930s).
- **Second** are relatively new **regional parties** in states where Congress/Janta Party previously held sway and emerged in the 1980s. E. g **TDP, AGP, MNF** etc

### Rise Of Regional Parties

- According to **Milan Vaishnav**, the rise of regional political parties is an eternal theme of Indian politics.
  - Since regional parties operate within limited geographic areas and bank on language, minority, religion etc the number of regional parties in India is much larger due to diversity.
  - There are institutional factors such as
    - **Delinking of parliamentary and state legislative elections** gave space to regional parties for mobilisation of people on local issues.
    - **India's Federal polity**→State governments deal with issues of day to day relevance so this also gives space to the regional parties.
    - **Linguistic reorganisation of states** has given rise to the dominant caste forming their own regional parties.
  - Social and economic factors

- **The Green Revolution** gave rise to the intermediate caste asserting their power even in the political sphere.
- **The deepening of social cleavages** as a result of the continuous mobilisation of people on ethnic grounds.
- Prof M.P Singh and Rekha Saxena have highlighted the dual impact of rise of regional parties

### How They Strengthen Democracy And Federalism

- **Prakash Sarangi** points that rise of regional parties has opened the democratic space in Indian polity. Similarly, **Niraja Gopal Jayal** remarks that parties based on Subaltern identities (e.g. BSP) help to “broaden the frontiers of Indian democracy “.
- Regional parties form coalition governments at national level by having an alliance with the National Party.
  - Since 1996 nearly every one of the state party has got an opportunity to be a part of one or the other national level coalition government.
  - This has contributed to the strengthening of federalism and democracy in our country.
- They also act as a check and balance on the centralising tendencies of the central executive.
- **MP SINGH** argues that though regional bases of such parties make them demand separate states and sometimes secessionist demands, yet participation in federation has moderated their claims as they became **co-sharers in federal power**.
- It also brought **regional issues** into the national policy front, which were earlier ignored.

### Issues Arising Due To Regional Parties

- Rise of regional parties led to the coalition politics, Coalition politics in the absence of healthy coalition culture has given rise to party paralysis and Increased role of money and muscle power.
- Politicisation of the post of speaker.
- Decline of parliament
- Regional issues dominate over national concerns.
- **Zoya Hasan points out** that “since these parties lack a ideology of its own,they mobilize people on existing faultiness , exacerbating social and region divides” e.g. **Shivsena - Marathi vs Non-Marathi**

### Conclusion

- Thus from a theoretical lens it can be said that regional parties have been a double edged sword for Indian democracy and federalism but in practice they have contributed to the deepening of democracy (**Yogendra Yadav**) and have brought diverse regional perspectives at the national front.

Sleepy Classes IAS